

TO: Governing Board X Action

FROM: Dr. Susan J. Cook, Superintendent X Discussion

DATE: April 9, 2015 Information

AGENDA ITEM: Interest-Based Negotiations (IBN) Team’s Recommendations for 2015-2016 1st Reading

INITIATED BY: Interest-Based Negotiations Team SUBMITTED BY: Dr. Susan J. Cook, Superintendent, and IBN Team Members

PRESENTER AT GOVERNING BOARD MEETING: Sue Snyder, Director of Organizational Development

GOVERNING BOARD POLICY REFERENCE OR STATUTORY CITATION: BBA

SUPPORTING DATA

Funding Source: Various
 Budgeted: In Process

The mission of the Interest-Based Negotiations (IBN) Team is to provide a collaborative forum for addressing District-wide terms and conditions of employment. The group is composed of certified, classified and administrator employee representatives; additionally, Superintendent Dr. Susie Cook serves as representative for the Governing Board. IBN members utilize interest-based strategies, including consensus-building and trust-building techniques, to reach agreement regarding compensation and working condition recommendations.

Each of the issues addressed by the 2014-2015 IBN Team was considered in light of the following Governing Board interests.

- Provide an increase in salaries, if possible, for all employee groups.
- Attract and maintain a stable workforce through working conditions.
- Maintain local control in decision making.
- Promote positive community relations through the budget process.
- Maintain, and possibly enhance, the integrity of programming, instructional delivery and parity, focusing on student achievement.
- Balance the budget.
- Optimize all funding sources.
- If additional funding is made available from state and/or federal sources, restoration of previous cuts will be considered.
- Maintain or decrease class size.

SUMMARY AND RECOMMENDATION

See page 2.

Superintendent _____

Board Action	Motion	Second	Ave	Nav	Abstain
Adams					
Graziano					
Herrera					
Jahneke					
Lambert					

Interest-Based Negotiations (IBN) Team's Recommendations for 2015-2016

April 9, 2015

Page 2

- Encourage and promote safety for staff and students.
- Explore access to professional duty days for all staff.

The following are among the issues that the IBN Team addressed this year:

- Employee compensation
- Stipends for temporary, after-school instructors
- Paid time off – general leave
- Teacher planning time
- Employee phased retirement program
- Substitute coverage
- Salary/stipend anomalies

SUMMARY AND RECOMMENDATION

1. It is recommended that a one-time, lump sum payment be distributed to employees according to a tiered payment matrix that is based on length of consecutive employment with WESD. Employees with a start date of 2/1/2015 or earlier are eligible to receive the one-time, lump sum payment, including those whose salary is at or beyond the current ending salary of the applicable salary schedule.
 - On 8/21/2015, distribute a one-time, lump sum payment of \$300.00 to each 1.0 FTE employee with a start date between 7/1/2011 and 2/1/2015, and still employed by WESD in a regular position as of 8/14/2015. For less than full-time employees, prorate the lump sum based on FTE as of 3/31/2015.
 - On 8/21/2015, distribute a one-time, lump sum payment of \$350.00 to each 1.0 FTE employee with a start date between 7/1/2006 and 6/30/2011, and still employed by WESD in a regular position as of 8/14/2015. For less than full-time employees, prorate the lump sum based on FTE as of 3/31/2015.
 - On 8/21/2015, distribute a one-time, lump sum payment of \$400.00 to each 1.0 FTE employee with a start date between 7/1/2001 and 6/30/2006, and still employed by WESD in a regular position as of 8/14/2015. For less than full-time employees, prorate the lump sum based on FTE as of 3/31/2015.
 - On 8/21/2015, distribute a one-time, lump sum payment of \$450.00 to each 1.0 FTE employee with a start date between 7/1/1996 and 6/30/2001, and still employed by WESD in a regular position as of 8/14/2015. For less than full-time employees, prorate the lump sum based on FTE as of 3/31/2015.
 - On 8/21/2015, distribute a one-time, lump sum payment of \$500.00 to each 1.0 FTE employee with a start date between 7/1/1991 and 6/30/1996, and still employed by WESD in a regular position as of 8/14/2015. For less than full-time employees, prorate the lump sum based on FTE as of 3/31/2015.
 - On 8/21/2015, distribute a one-time, lump sum payment of \$550.00 to each 1.0 FTE employee with a start date between 7/1/1986 and 6/30/1991, and still employed by WESD in a regular position as of 8/14/2015. For less than full-time employees, prorate the lump sum based on FTE as of 3/31/2015.
 - On 8/21/2015, distribute a one-time, lump sum payment of \$600.00 to each 1.0 FTE employee with a start date of 6/30/1986 or earlier, and still employed by WESD in a regular position as of 8/14/2015. For less than full-time employees, prorate the lump sum based on FTE as of 3/31/2015.

The cost of this compensation plan is approximately \$1 million.

2. It is recommended that the stipend hourly rate for temporary, after-school instructors be increased from \$20.33 to \$25.00 effective with the 2015-2016 school year, with no cost to the M&O budget.

Interest-Based Negotiations Recommendations for 2015-2016

I. Identify the issue from the perspective of involved stakeholders.

Issue:

Each school year, the Interest-Based Negotiations (IBN) Team analyzes the District's employee compensation programs and makes recommendations to the Governing Board for the subsequent year. The recommendations should meet the best interests of the District, with student growth the ultimate goal.

Involved Stakeholders:

The 2014-2015 IBN Team is composed of certified, classified and administrator employee representatives; Superintendent Dr. Susie Cook serves as representative for the Governing Board. Of the 24-member team, 17 are voting members, and the remaining 7 are non-voting, resource persons. Please refer to *Attachment A* for a list of 2014-2015 IBN members.

IBN Team members participated in six scheduled, full-day meetings between December 8, 2014 and April 6, 2015 (*Attachment B*). Members of IBN's subcommittees met on several other occasions during late afternoon/early evening hours.

II. Identify the options or alternatives that address the issue, including an option to maintain the status quo, utilizing the efficient and sufficient use of research and data. For each option, identify advantages and disadvantages.

Research/Data:

Research conducted by the IBN Team included the following:

- Analyzing results of a District-wide employee working conditions survey
- Tracking federal and state legislative actions that have potential impact on WESD budget
- Receiving WESD financial status and ADM updates from Director of Business Services Cathy Thompson
- Reviewing relevant information from neighboring districts

Options – 2015-2016 SCHOOL YEAR

The *issues* that were addressed by the 2014-2015 IBN Team, as well as the related *options* that team members generated, the *interests/criteria* according to which they evaluated each option and their ensuing IBN *recommendations* are described below.

ISSUE A: EMPLOYEE COMPENSATION

• Description

Based on the fiscal year 2015-2016 budget approved by the Arizona Legislature and signed by Governor Ducey on March 13, 2015, Director of Business Services Cathy Thompson estimates that

\$1 million is available to apply toward WESD employee compensation for the 2015-2016 school year. There is no indication, however, that those funds will be available on an ongoing basis.

- **Options**

Given the funding situation, IBN's Salary Subcommittee proposed to the IBN Team that additional compensation be afforded to employees as one-time money rather than as an ongoing salary increase. IBN voting members concurred, with full consensus.

Four options were discussed regarding the distribution of one-time monies, all of which involved a tiered approach based on longevity of employment with the District.

- **Evaluating Options**

Each of the four options was evaluated in light of the following interests/criteria:

- Acknowledging longevity
- Giving everyone something
- Affordability
- Improving morale/making employees feel valued/recognizing current workforce
- Taking a nibble out of compression
- Retaining quality staff/providing incentive for people to stay
- Being competitive with other districts
- Ensuring employees perceive that the recommendation is as fair as possible
- Meeting Governing Board interests
- Legality
- "Doability"

Upon evaluating the options, IBN Team members reached full consensus on the following compensation plan design:

Distribute a one-time, lump sum payment to employees according to a tiered payment matrix that is based on length of consecutive employment with WESD. Employees with a start date of 2/1/2015 or earlier are eligible to receive the one-time, lump sum payment, including those whose salary is at or beyond the current ending salary of the applicable salary schedule.

- On 8/21/2015, distribute a one-time, lump sum payment of \$300.00 to each 1.0 FTE employee with a start date between 7/1/2011 and 2/1/2015, and still employed by WESD in a regular position as of 8/14/2015. For less than full-time employees, prorate the lump sum based on FTE as of 3/31/2015.
- On 8/21/2015, distribute a one-time, lump sum payment of \$350.00 to each 1.0 FTE employee with a start date between 7/1/2006 and 6/30/2011, and still employed by WESD in a regular position as of 8/14/2015. For less than full-time employees, prorate the lump sum based on FTE as of 3/31/2015.
- On 8/21/2015, distribute a one-time, lump sum payment of \$400.00 to each 1.0 FTE employee with a start date between 7/1/2001 and 6/30/2006, and still employed by WESD in a regular position as of 8/14/2015. For less than full-time employees, prorate the lump sum based on FTE as of 3/31/2015.
- On 8/21/2015, distribute a one-time, lump sum payment of \$450.00 to each 1.0 FTE employee with a start date between 7/1/1996 and 6/30/2001, and still employed by WESD in

- a regular position as of 8/14/2015. For less than full-time employees, prorate the lump sum based on FTE as of 3/31/2015.
- On 8/21/2015, distribute a one-time, lump sum payment of \$500.00 to each 1.0 FTE employee with a start date between 7/1/1991 and 6/30/1996, and still employed by WESD in a regular position as of 8/14/2015. For less than full-time employees, prorate the lump sum based on FTE as of 3/31/2015.
 - On 8/21/2015, distribute a one-time, lump sum payment of \$550.00 to each 1.0 FTE employee with a start date between 7/1/1986 and 6/30/1991, and still employed by WESD in a regular position as of 8/14/2015. For less than full-time employees, prorate the lump sum based on FTE as of 3/31/2015.
 - On 8/21/2015, distribute a one-time, lump sum payment of \$600.00 to each 1.0 FTE employee with a start date of 6/30/1986 or earlier, and still employed by WESD in a regular position as of 8/14/2015. For less than full-time employees, prorate the lump sum based on FTE as of 3/31/2015.

The cost of this compensation plan is approximately \$1 million.

- **Recommendation**

IBN is recommending that one-time monies be distributed according to the parameters outlined in the compensation design described above, to be paid in full to eligible employees in their August 21, 2015 paycheck and based on the employee's FTE as of March 31, 2015. The total cost for this recommendation is approximately \$1 million.

ISSUE B: STIPENDS FOR TEMPORARY, AFTER-SCHOOL INSTRUCTORS

- **Description**

A stipend is a fixed sum of money that is paid to an employee, either as an incentive or as compensation for taking on additional responsibilities outside of the employee's regular employment. Effective with the 2009-2010 school year, most stipends were reduced by 25 percent as a budget-saving measure. Beginning in 2014-2015, stipends for after-school athletic coaches were increased in order to attract quality personnel and maintain effective programs. The stipends for after-school instructors, however, have continued to be based on an hourly rate of \$20.33. This rate has been in effect for many, many years, and it is no longer sufficient to attract certified staff to fill vacancies; in fact, on an hourly basis, it is less than the District's beginning teacher salary. Moreover, after-school instructor position responsibilities and challenges have increased significantly during recent years.

- **Options**

After brainstorming a variety of options, IBN's Salary Subcommittee proposed the following straw design:

- Increase the hourly rate for temporary, after-school instructors from \$20.33 to \$25.00. This increase would be effective with the 2015-2016 school year and would apply to temporary, after-school instructor positions that are associated with the following programs:
 - 21 Century
 - University Academy
 - Extended School Year (ESY)
 - Refugee Adult Classes

- Other adult education classes
- Advertise the pay for temporary, after-school instructor positions as the anticipated full stipend amount, even if it is to be paid on an hourly basis.
- Maintain the current hourly rate of \$20.33 for other certified stipends, including those for cadre leaders, advisors (student council, National Junior Honor Society, yearbook), coaches and professional development trainers, as well as for summer committee work and scheduling.

Because the temporary, after-school instructor stipends are grant funded, this proposal would have no impact on the M&O budget.

- **Evaluating Options**

The proposed straw design meets the following interests/criteria:

- Attract quality teachers
- Attract current WESD teachers
- Competitiveness
- Value
- Filling positions
- Community perception
- Grant compliance
- Fiscal responsibility
- Efficiency
- Sustainability

- **Recommendation**

IBN is recommending that the stipend hourly rate for temporary, after-school instructors be increased from \$20.33 to \$25.00 effective with the 2015-2016 school year.

ISSUE C: PAID TIME OFF – GENERAL LEAVE

- **Description**

Based on a proposal developed by last year's IBN Team, employees' acceptable use of general leave was broadened for the 2014-2015 school year. Components of the proposal, as reflected in Regulation GCCA-R/GDCA-R, Professional/Support Staff General Leave, were implemented with the caveat that current IBN members would assess the impact of changes on employee absenteeism and consider possible modifications for 2015-2016.

The following information came to light during IBN's assessment of the revised general leave regulation:

- District-wide, from the beginning of the 2014-2015 school year through 3/27/2015, teacher and health service personnel absences have increased by 20.7 percent compared to the same period last year.
- District-wide absences for classified staff, from the beginning of the current school year through 3/19/2015, have increased by 1.9 percent compared to the same period last year.
- Data indicates that implementation of blackout days (the day before or after a holiday or break, during the week of state testing, site-specific parent/teacher conference days, the pre-week and first week of the instructional year, and the final week of the instructional year) on

which general leave may be used only with approval of the Superintendent or designee, has been effective.

- The Superintendent and designee have been relatively liberal in granting general leave blackout day requests this year; however, that is not likely to continue in the future.
- Since general leave changes were implemented, more employees have asked their principal for permission to use general leave for nontraditional purposes.
- Teachers have expressed gratitude at not having to justify or explain their absences.
- IBN Team members and District administration anticipated some increase in absenteeism with the revised leave regulation; however, it is unclear at this time if that increase is excessive.

- **Options**

For the 2015-2016 school year, IBN members considered the options of reverting back to the pre-2014-2015 general leave regulation or continuing to implement the current general leave regulation, with or without adjustments. The group reached full consensus on the following straw design:

- Extend implementation of the 2014-2015 general leave regulation during the 2015-2016 school year.
- Solicit feedback and collect data pertaining to the impact of the broadened definition and use of general leave in order to determine if it is meeting its intent, i.e., enhancing employee morale, retention and productivity, and promoting consistency in supervisors' interpretation and enforcement of the regulation.
- As schools develop their substitute plans for 2015-2016, encourage principals to review the general leave regulation with staff and to address the impact of frequent and avoidable absences.

- **Evaluating Options**

The straw design meets the interests/criteria that were identified by last year's IBN members when they proposed the 2014-2015 revisions to the general leave regulation:

- Promotes employee morale
- Promotes employee retention
- Provides flexibility to employees
- Removes current ambiguity
- Addresses inconsistencies
- Helps to prevent long-term absences
- Gives supervisors authority to approve or deny "other" reasons
- Helps prevent heavy absenteeism before/after holidays, during first week of instruction, during state testing
- Allows consideration of special circumstances

Additionally, by continuing implementation of the general leave revisions during 2015-2016, the District will collect greater and more valid data with which to assess the impact of the revisions.

- **Recommendation**

No Governing Board recommendation is required at this time. Regulation GCCA-R/GDCA-R, Professional/Support Staff General Leave, will be updated to reflect the extension of the 2014-2015 regulation revisions for the 2015-2016 school year. The 2015-2016 IBN Team will review general leave data to further identify the impact of these changes on employee absenteeism and to consider the advisability of extending the revisions beyond the 2015-2016 school year.

ISSUE D: TEACHER PLANNING TIME

- **Description**

In reviewing results of WESD's sixth annual working conditions survey, IBN members noted that only 54 percent of respondents agreed or strongly agreed with the statement, "I have enough time to complete my work." Furthermore, some certified employees have expressed concern that their prep time has diminished during recent years. Instead of having self-directed time to prepare for upcoming lessons, their designated prep time is often monopolized by meetings, e.g., team, grade level, department, staff, IEP, SST, as well as coverage for absent teachers' classes. Simultaneously, teachers' workload and accountability has increased during recent years. IBN members discussed this issue and brainstormed possible options to address it. A subcommittee was charged with developing a proposal regarding teacher planning time.

- **Options**

The subcommittee's proposal is reflected in the draft changes to Regulation GCL-R/GDK-R, Staff Schedules and Calendars (*Attachment C*). Significant revisions include the following:

- Changing "preparation time" to "planning time"
- Requiring each site to collaboratively develop an annual plan to address both collaborative and individual teacher planning needs
- Requiring that the schedules for school events and meetings outside the school day be developed collaboratively with those impacted
- Stipulating that all teachers be assigned duties in an equitable manner
- Allowing certified staff to occasionally use flex time to accommodate appointments that cannot be arranged outside normal work hours

- **Evaluating Options**

The subcommittee's proposal was approved by IBN members based on its alignment with the following interests/criteria:

- Happy teachers/improving morale
- Reducing amount of time teachers have to work at home
- Educating teachers regarding planning time
- Creating more efficiencies
- Ensuring balance between collaborative and individual planning time
- Consistency
- Productivity
- Legality
- Accountability
- Addresses needs

- **Recommendation**

No Governing Board recommendation is required at this time. Teacher planning time revisions are reflected in Regulation GCL-R/GDK-R, Staff Schedules and Calendars.

ISSUE E: EMPLOYEE PHASED RETIREMENT PROGRAM

On January 9, 2015, the Governing Board approved IBN's phased retirement program recommendation for the 2015-2016 school year.

OTHER ISSUES

The following is a brief recap of some of the other issues that were addressed by the 2014-2015 IBN Team, none of which generated a Governing Board recommendation.

- **Substitute Coverage**

Every year, beginning in 2009-2010, each school has been allocated a substitute teacher budget based on the number of teachers at the school who require a substitute when absent and the District's total substitute budget. A school's allocation is not nearly adequate to cover its teachers' available leave days, and some schools have exceeded their substitute budget during one or more years. Every school develops an annual plan for covering teacher absences if the school has depleted its budget or if a substitute is unavailable. IBN members discussed this concern and brainstormed options; however, many options required the allocation of funding. Instead, ideas became focused on ways to improve substitutes' experiences and encourage them to fill future absences. Based on input from WESD's substitute coordinator and site administrators, suggestions will be shared throughout the District for the upcoming school year.

- **Salary/Stipend Anomalies**

IBN considered the following salary/stipend anomalies:

- Bilingual pay for Central Registration office employees
- Credit for CCB intervention specialists who hold a master's degree in counseling
- Bilingual stipend for eligible social workers

The interest-based process was applied in addressing each proposed anomaly. No recommendations resulted; however, appropriate follow up will ensue. Additionally, IBN codified and approved a definition for anomalies and a process through which the Human Resources Department and IBN will address them. The resulting information is posted on the District Web site.

III. Use conclusion(s) to develop a rationale and prepare recommendation(s) to present to the Governing Board for action.

Recommendations:

1. It is recommended that a one-time, lump sum payment be distributed to employees according to a tiered payment matrix that is based on length of consecutive employment with WESD. Employees with a start date of 2/1/2015 or earlier are eligible to receive the one-time, lump sum payment, including those whose salary is at or beyond the current ending salary of the applicable salary schedule.
 - On 8/21/2015, distribute a one-time, lump sum payment of \$300.00 to each 1.0 FTE employee with a start date between 7/1/2011 and 2/1/2015, and still employed by WESD in a regular position as of 8/14/2015. For less than full-time employees, prorate the lump sum based on FTE as of 3/31/2015.
 - On 8/21/2015, distribute a one-time, lump sum payment of \$350.00 to each 1.0 FTE employee with a start date between 7/1/2006 and 6/30/2011, and still employed by WESD in a regular position as of 8/14/2015. For less than full-time employees, prorate the lump sum based on FTE as of 3/31/2015.
 - On 8/21/2015, distribute a one-time, lump sum payment of \$400.00 to each 1.0 FTE employee with a start date between 7/1/2001 and 6/30/2006, and still employed by WESD in

- a regular position as of 8/14/2015. For less than full-time employees, prorate the lump sum based on FTE as of 3/31/2015.
- On 8/21/2015, distribute a one-time, lump sum payment of \$450.00 to each 1.0 FTE employee with a start date between 7/1/1996 and 6/30/2001, and still employed by WESD in a regular position as of 8/14/2015. For less than full-time employees, prorate the lump sum based on FTE as of 3/31/2015.
 - On 8/21/2015, distribute a one-time, lump sum payment of \$500.00 to each 1.0 FTE employee with a start date between 7/1/1991 and 6/30/1996, and still employed by WESD in a regular position as of 8/14/2015. For less than full-time employees, prorate the lump sum based on FTE as of 3/31/2015.
 - On 8/21/2015, distribute a one-time, lump sum payment of \$550.00 to each 1.0 FTE employee with a start date between 7/1/1986 and 6/30/1991, and still employed by WESD in a regular position as of 8/14/2015. For less than full-time employees, prorate the lump sum based on FTE as of 3/31/2015.
 - On 8/21/2015, distribute a one-time, lump sum payment of \$600.00 to each 1.0 FTE employee with a start date of 6/30/1986 or earlier, and still employed by WESD in a regular position as of 8/14/2015. For less than full-time employees, prorate the lump sum based on FTE as of 3/31/2015.

The cost of this compensation plan is approximately \$1 million.

2. It is recommended that the stipend hourly rate for temporary, after-school instructors be increased from \$20.33 to \$25.00 effective with the 2015-2016 school year, with no cost to the M&O budget.

WASHINGTON ELEMENTARY SCHOOL DISTRICT No. 6

TO: Governing Board X Action

FROM: Dr. Susan J. Cook, Superintendent X Discussion

DATE: January 8, 2015 Information

AGENDA ITEM: Employee Phased Retirement Program 1st Reading

INITIATED BY: Interest-Based Negotiations Team SUBMITTED BY: Dr. Susan J. Cook, Superintendent

PRESENTER AT GOVERNING BOARD MEETING: Justin Wing, Director of Human Resources

GOVERNING BOARD POLICY REFERENCE OR STATUTORY CITATION: BBA; ARS §15-502; ARS §38-766.02

SUPPORTING DATA

Funding Source: Various
Budgeted: Yes

Phased retirement programs provide benefits to both participants and employers. Participants are afforded additional time to accumulate retirement savings. Employers realize cost savings while retaining experienced employees and the institutional knowledge they possess.

smartschoolsplus, inc. offers a phased retirement program for Arizona public school districts and their eligible employees. As a third party entity, the company provides a means of circumventing the return-to-work restriction, i.e., the 20/20 rule, which is imposed upon an Arizona State Retirement System (ASRS) retiree during his or her first year of retirement. Upon retiring from a school district and through ASRS, an individual may be employed by *smartschoolsplus, inc.* as a temporary contract employee; having entered into a contract with the given school district, *smartschoolsplus, inc.* leases the individual back to the district. Typically, the individual is placed in the same or comparable position that he or she held prior to retiring. The individual is able to work full-time while collecting his or her ASRS pension, and the district saves the cost of health insurance and other fringe benefits that would be paid if the individual were a district employee.

Beginning with the 2004-2005 school year and through the end of the 2008-2009 school year, eligible Washington Elementary School District (WESD) employees were able to participate in a phased retirement/employee leaseback program through *smartschoolsplus, inc.* At the recommendation of WESD’s Interest-Based Negotiations (IBN) Team

SUMMARY AND RECOMMENDATION

It is recommended that the Governing Board authorize WESD to pursue a contract with *smartschoolsplus, inc.* for the 2015-2016 school year, in accordance with the parameters set forth in the Interest-Based Negotiations Team’s proposal.

Superintendent _____

Board Action	Motion	Second	Ave	Nav	Abstain
Adams					
Graziano					
Herrera					
Jahneke					
Lambert					

Employee Phased Retirement Program

January 8, 2015

Page 2

and approval by the Governing Board, phased retirement through *smartschoolsplus, inc.* was reinstated for 2011-2012 as a one-year program that included stipulations and conditions that had not been previously addressed. The Governing Board approved an updated IBN recommendation for a one-year phased retirement program, again through *smartschoolsplus, inc.*, for 2012-2013. That proposal addressed the ASRS alternate contribution rate (ACR), which has been in effect since July 1, 2012 and requires ASRS employers to contribute, at an alternate rate, on behalf of retired ASRS members whom they employ as direct, leased or contractual employees. A slightly modified one-year phased retirement program, through *smartschoolsplus, inc.*, was presented to and approved by the Governing Board for 2013-2014 and subsequently for 2014-2015.

During their December 8, 2014 meeting, WESD IBN Team members considered the feasibility of recommending that an employee phased retirement program be reauthorized for the 2015-2016 school year. Details regarding the group's interest-based process are attached, and Director of Human Resources Justin Wing is available to answer Governing Board members' questions regarding IBN's recommendation.

Employee Phased Retirement Program

Issue:

On January 9, 2014, in response to a recommendation developed by the 2013-2014 Interest-Based Negotiations (IBN) Team, the Governing Board authorized WESD to pursue a one-year employee phased retirement program by contracting with *smartschoolsplus, inc.* for the 2014-2015 school year. Currently, as 2015-2016 staffing and budget projections are being addressed, the possibility of offering a phased retirement option for the upcoming school year is again being considered.

Involved Stakeholders:

WESD's 2014-2015 IBN Team applied interest-based strategies to examine the phased retirement program issue and to reach a consensus recommendation for presentation to the Governing Board. The Team is composed of certified, classified and administrator representatives, and Superintendent Dr. Susie Cook serves as representative for the Governing Board. Of the 24-member team, 17 are voting members; the remaining 7 serve in a non-voting, resource capacity. IBN Team members discussed the phased retirement issue during their December 8, 2014 meeting.

Components of the Interest-Based Process:

- **Story:** *the subject of discussion; the problem to be solved*
The following are story details offered by IBN members to explain the issue under consideration:
 - During the current school year, 31.125 FTE participate in the phased retirement program, which is costing WESD approximately \$650,000 less than if all had remained District employees for the year.
 - The Arizona State Retirement Alternate Contribution Rate will be less next year than it is currently.
 - The phased retirement program helps employees transition to retirement.
 - Phased retirement helps bridge a gap for an employee who wishes to receive retirement benefits, yet continue to work.
 - The program helps WESD address the current teacher shortage.
 - The program helps the District retain experienced employees and maintain a balance between new and veteran staff.
 - The program enables the Human Resources Department to anticipate some staffing needs a year in advance.
 - WESD employees accept phased retirement as a practice, and they plan on its being offered.
 - The Governing Board approves the phased retirement program for one year at a time; therefore, it needs to be reviewed and reconsidered each year.
 - WESD determines the salaries to be offered to those who participate in the phased retirement program.
 - The phased retirement agency, *smartschoolsplus, inc.*, offers health insurance to its participants.

- **Interests:** *the concerns, needs or desires underlying an issue*
IBN members discussed the following interests with respect to the issue of phased retirement:

- Retaining qualified teachers in the classroom
 - Providing a perceived benefit to employees, as long as it is a benefit to the District
 - Enabling WESD employees to plan ahead
 - Saving money for the District
- **Criteria:** *the look fors, standards or set of factors according to which options are evaluated*
IBN members developed the following list of criteria:
 - Possibility that the AZ Legislature will consider disallowing
 - Fairness to everyone
 - Viability with regard to saving money
- **Options:** *ways of addressing interests, stated as potential solutions*
IBN members brainstormed the following options:
 - Option 1: Do nothing.
 - Option 2: Renew the phased retirement plan for another year.
 - Option 3: Research other phased retirement providers.
 - Option 4: Resubmit last year's phased retirement plan without material changes.
 - Option 5: Look for \$1 million savings for the District.
 - Option 6: Offer a multi-year contract with *smartschoolsplus, inc.*
- **Evaluating Options:** *considering each option in light of identified interests and criteria*

Upon evaluation, IBN members reached full consensus to recommend a combination of Option 2 and Option 4, i.e., to recommend that the Governing Board authorize the District to pursue a phased retirement program with *smartschoolsplus, inc.* for the 2015-2016 school year, given the following parameters:

- The program will remain in effect for one year only (2015-2016).
- The program is intended for eligible employees who wish to work for WESD for only one more year.
- At the end of 2015-2016, positions held by program participants will be opened as vacancies or considered for possible reductions. Program participants may reapply to WESD to be considered for posted vacancies; external application, selection, salary placement and benefits procedures will apply.
- The program will be open to eligible classified employees, certified employees and administrators.
- There will be only one entry date into the program (July 1) for eligible participants.
- To be eligible, an individual must
 - have been employed by WESD for one or more years;
 - have not received an *unsatisfactory* or *ineffective* performance rating on either of his or her two most recent evaluations;
 - qualify for full retirement benefits through ASRS;
 - complete the WESD application process.
- Selection of program participants from among eligible applicants will be based on the combined results of an individual's Reduction in Force Rubric, if applicable, and performance evaluations.

- A program participant's intended placement will be at the site where he or she was located immediately prior to retirement.
- A program participant will receive 75 percent of the base salary or hourly rate earned during his or her final year of employment with WESD. Overtime calculations, if applicable, will be based on the hourly rate earned by the program participant.
- WESD will pay *smartschoolsplus, inc.* 86 percent of the base salary earned by the program participant during his or her final year of District employment.
- WESD will pay the Arizona State Retirement System the 2015-2016 alternate contribution rate per program participant.
- WESD will not pay program participants' health insurance.
- Program participants will be granted all general leave time up front.
 - 12-month employees will receive 12 days of general leave.
 - Employees who work fewer than 12 months per year will receive 10 days of general leave.
- Program participants who are 12-month employees will be granted 10 vacation days up front.
- Program participants will not be eligible for professional development days.
- Program participants will not be eligible to receive incentives or performance pay.
- Program participants will be eligible to receive stipends for additional work completed, if applicable; in such circumstances, WESD will pay the full current stipend amount to *smartschoolsplus, inc.* If earned, stipends will be paid to program participants on a quarterly basis. Participants must submit completed stipend paperwork within designated timeframes in order to ensure prompt payment.
- Program participants will not be eligible to serve on
 - IBN Team
 - Planning and Steering Council
 - Facilities Council
- Program participants will be allowed to serve on
 - a curriculum related committee, if the committee's work impacts the participant's current year students;
 - a committee, including Site Council, only if doing so is a requirement of the participant's position; determination of said requirement is to be overseen by the principal or Superintendent/designee.
- Program participants are not to be paid for any days for which regular District employees are not compensated, i.e., furlough days.
- The District may use the services of the phased retirement agency to fill position vacancies, and in doing so, must adhere to standard District protocol for working with any contract staffing agency.
 - An individual contracted through the phased retirement agency will receive 75 percent of the position base salary (or hourly rate), determined according to the District's new hire placement procedures.
 - An individual may be contracted through the phased retirement agency to begin work at any time during the fiscal year. Such flexibility in filling vacancies will support the District's efforts to meet ongoing educational and administrative needs.
 - An individual who is to be contracted through the phased retirement agency must provide a copy of his or her two most recent performance evaluations as evidence that he or she received no *unsatisfactory* or *ineffective* performance ratings on either evaluation.

Recommendation:

It is recommended that the Governing Board authorize WESD to pursue a contract with *smartschoolsplus, inc.* for the 2015-2016 school year in accordance with the parameters set forth in the Interest-Based Negotiations Team's proposal.